

## MINUTES

### CITY PLAN COMMISSION/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

SEPTEMBER 21, 2015

The City Plan Commission/Architectural Review Board of the City of Clayton, Missouri, met upon the above date at 5:30 p.m. Upon roll call, the following responded:

Present:

Chairman Steve Lichtenfeld  
Mark Winings, Aldermanic Representative  
Craig Owens, City Manager  
Ron Reim  
Josh Corson  
Sherry Eisenberg  
Pepe Finn

Absent:

None

Also Present:

Louis Clayton, Planner  
Susan M. Istenes, AICP, Planning Director

Chairman Lichtenfeld asked that all cell phone ringers be turned off, that conversations take place outside the meeting room and that those who wish to speak approach the podium and to be sure the green light on the microphone is on for property recording of this meeting.

## MINUTES

The minutes of the September 9<sup>th</sup>, 2015 meeting were approved, after having been previously distributed to each member.

### SITE PLAN REVIEW/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW – NEW CONSTRUCTION – SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE – 205 BRIGHTON WAY

David Volz, civil engineer and Edward Stevens, project architect, were in attendance at the meeting.

Susan Istenes explained that the proposed project consists of the demolition of an existing one-story home and the construction of a 2,676-square-foot (excluding the basement) single-family

residence with an attached, rear-entry, at-grade garage. The height of the proposed residence is 26 feet 10.5 inches as measured from the average existing grade to the mean height of the roof. The plans show the HVAC units located at the south side of the home and screened by evergreen landscaping. Trash will be stored in a 32-square-foot trash enclosure located at the end of the driveway. The trash enclosure will be screened by a wood fence and gate. The Clayton Gardens Urban Design District limits impervious coverage to 40 percent of the total lot area and allows an increase in impervious coverage based on the garage placement. For this project, the allowable impervious coverage may be increased to 55 percent for the inclusion of an attached, at-grade, rear-loading garage. The existing impervious coverage on site is 53.7 percent. The new plans decrease the impervious coverage to 50.9 percent, which is below the maximum allowable impervious coverage of 55 percent. The existing storm water runoff, according to the MSD 15 year, 20 minute calculation, is 0.57 cubic feet per second (CFS). The proposed runoff is 0.56 CFS, which represents a decrease in 0.01 CFS, therefore, storm water mitigation is not required. All downspouts will be piped to two pop-up bubblers in the rear yard and one in the front yard. The Public Works Department finds the storm water plan acceptable. The proposed landscape design features a variety of understory trees, ornamental shrubs and perennials that are appropriate for the size of the site and character of the neighborhood. There is 5 feet of exposed brick below the windows on the front façade of the home. The City's contracted landscape architect recommends more vertical plantings at the foundation wall and behind the other proposed smaller plantings to soften the expanse of exposed brick. No trees will be removed from the site, and the plan proposes 25-caliper-inches of new deciduous and broadleaf evergreen trees. One existing street tree is proposed to be removed and replaced with two new street trees. The Public Works Department is of the opinion that the street tree is in good condition and therefore does not approve of its removal. An existing 30-caliper-inch Magnolia on site will be impacted during construction, and is shown to be protected and preserved per City guidelines. Exterior lighting is proposed at the rear exterior doors and at the garage. All exterior lights will be 75 watts or less. Susan noted that the height, setbacks, and impervious coverage as proposed are in conformance with the requirements of the R-2 Single Family Dwelling District and the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District. Storm water will be adequately managed on site, and the landscape plan features a variety of understory trees, ornamental shrubs and perennials that are appropriate for the size of the site and character of the neighborhood. Staff is of the opinion that the project meets the criteria for site plan approval and therefore recommends approval with the condition that the applicant submit a revised landscape plan showing additional vertical plantings at the foundation wall and behind the other proposed smaller plantings to soften the expanse of exposed brick on the front façade, and the protection and preservation of the existing street tree.

Mr. Volz presented a site plan to the members, noting that the house features a rear entry garage. He pointed out the locations of the HVAC & trash enclosure and noted that the street tree will be saved. A storm water flow graph depicting current flow and proposed flow was shown. He indicated that storm water flow will be reduced. He stated that a 1-2 foot tall wall will separate the driveways.

Chairman Lichtenfeld asked if the new driveway will be lower than the adjacent driveway.

Mr. Volz replied “slightly”. He then showed the members the location of the pop-up bubblers .

Being no further questions or comments, and after verbal notification that the street tree is to remain, Ron Reim made a motion to approve per staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Josh Corson and unanimously approved by the members.

The architectural aspects of the project were now up for review.

Susan Istenes explained that properties located west of Forsyth Boulevard in Clayton Gardens have traditionally been developed with one-story ranch homes with a strong horizontal orientation. The basic massing of the proposed home is articulated on all sides with windows, doors, accent material, and variations in roof forms. The home to the south (201 Brighton Way) was constructed in 1947 and is +/- 11 feet shorter than the proposed home (as measured from the mid-point of each roof). The home to the north (209 Brighton Way) was constructed in 1960 and is +/- 8 feet shorter than the proposed home (as measured from the mid-point of each roof). As required by Section 410.385 of the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District, to avoid tall, blocky building forms, new structures shall incorporate a transition in height and scale through one of six possible techniques. For this project, the following permitted techniques are used:

1. Stepping-down to meet the approximate height of the adjacent structures.
2. Utilizing dormers and sloping roofs to accommodate upper stories.
3. Increasing the side yard setback one foot for every five feet the height of the structure exceeds the height of the adjacent structure at the side yard. *The required side yard setbacks are 7.09 feet and the proposed setback is 13.55 feet on the north side.*

The primary building material for the proposed home is red brick with taupe James Hardie siding. The proposed roof is clad in architectural shingles, weathered wood in color. White double hung windows are proposed. A 10-foot wide exposed aggregate driveway is proposed on the north side of the home that leads to a rear-entry, at-grade attached garage with two white paneled garage doors. A maximum 1.5-foot tall stacked stone retaining wall is proposed along the north side of the driveway and adjacent to the rear deck. No permanent fences are proposed. Susan stated that the project as proposed is in conformance with the requirements of the R-2 Single Family Dwelling District, the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District, and the Architectural Review Guidelines. Staff is of the opinion that the design is compatible in terms of mass, height, and design with existing nearby homes and that staff recommends approval as submitted.

Mr. Stevens presented a color rendering and samples of the roof, brick, and cement board. He explained that this is a 2-story, 2,676 square foot 3 bedroom, 2.5 bath residence that is primarily brick with some Hardie Board siding.

Chairman Lichtenfeld commented that it does respect the lower houses.

Sherry Eisenberg asked if there was a possibility of adding more windows on the right side.

Mr. Stevens indicated that that's the location of the closet and master bath.

Sherry Eisenberg noted that the lower house will basically be looking at a brick wall.

Chairman Lichtenfeld stated that they could recommend looking at adding more windows.

Sherry Eisenberg indicated that is a good idea.

Mr. Stevens asked about putting a transom window in the master bath.

Chairman Lichtenfeld stated that he didn't have anything specific in mind. He asked if the window on that side is a basement window.

Mr. Stevens replied "yes".

Josh Corson asked about the cut stone accent on the front façade.

Mr. Stevens stated that it is like limestone; a cut stone.

Mr. Stecko, owner, informed the members that he could put some transom windows in the closets.

Chairman Lichtenfeld noted that transom windows are quite high.

Being no further questions or comments, Chairman Lichtenfeld called for a motion.

Ron Reim made a motion to approve with the condition that a transom window be added to the closet and master bedroom to be approved by staff. The motion was seconded by Craig Owens and unanimously approved by the Board.

Chairman Lichtenfeld asked when they plan to break ground.

Mr. Stecko replied "as soon as the permit is issued."

#### SITE PLAN REVIEW/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW – NEW CONSTRUCTION – SINGLE FAMILY RESIDENCE – 8173 STRATFORD

Lauren Strutman, project architect, was in attendance. Also in attendance were David Volz, project civil engineer, and Scott, Blair and Mark Mehlman, developers.

Susan Istenes explained that this is a request for review of the site plan associated with the proposed construction of a 3,885-square-foot (excluding the basement) single-family residence

with an attached, rear-entry, at-grade garage. The height of the proposed residence is 29 feet 6.9 inches as measured from the average existing grade to the mean height of the roof. The plans show the HVAC units located at the northwest corner of the rear yard and screened by a 4-foot tall wood frame lattice fence. Trash will be stored in a 42-square-foot trash enclosure located at the end of the driveway. The trash enclosure will be screened by a wood fence and gate. The Clayton Gardens Urban Design District limits impervious coverage to 40 percent of the total lot area and allows an increase in impervious coverage based on the garage placement. For this project, the allowable impervious coverage may be increased to 55 percent for the inclusion of an attached, at-grade, rear-loading garage. The existing impervious coverage on site is 39.3 percent. The new plans increase the impervious coverage to 48.6 percent, which is below the maximum allowable impervious coverage of 55 percent. The existing storm water runoff, according to the MSD 15 year, 20 minute calculation, is 0.4 cubic feet per second (CFS). The proposed runoff is 0.42 CFS, which represents an increase in 0.02 CFS. To mitigate the increase in storm water runoff, downspouts on the rear of the home will be piped to a dry well in the rear yard. All other downspouts will be piped to a pop-up bubbler in the front yard. The Public Works Department finds the storm water plan acceptable. The proposed landscape design features a variety of understory trees, ornamental shrubs and perennials that are appropriate for the size of the site and character of the neighborhood. One tree totaling 15 caliper inches will be removed and requires onsite replacement. The landscape plan proposes 32 caliper inches of new deciduous and broadleaf evergreen trees on site. The City's contracted landscape architect is of the opinion that the proposed trees are suitable for the site. An existing tree on the adjacent property to the east will be impacted during construction. To avoid potential damage to the tree, it is recommended that the landscape plan be revised to show tree protection fencing on all sides of the tree. Exterior lighting is proposed at all exterior doors and at the garage. All exterior lights will be 75 watts or less. Susan stated that the height, setbacks, and impervious coverage as proposed are in conformance with the requirements of the R-2 Single Family Dwelling District and the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District. Storm water will be adequately managed on site, and the landscape plan features a variety of understory trees, ornamental shrubs and perennials that are appropriate for the size of the site and character of the neighborhood. Staff is of the opinion that the project meets the criteria for site plan approval and recommends approval with the following conditions, to be approved by staff prior to the issuance of a building permit:

1. That to ensure the future maintenance and operation of the dry well, the applicant shall record the approved site plan with St. Louis County and submit proof of recording to the City.
2. That the applicant submit a revised landscape plan showing tree protection fencing on all sides of the impacted tree located on the adjacent property to the east.

Ms. Strutman presented a site plan to the members, noting that because the garage is located at the rear third of the house, it is considered a rear entry garage. She noted the locations of the HVAC units and trash enclosure and noted that the site slopes off quite a bit. She indicated that they are happy to comply with the conditions as recommended by staff.

Mr. Volz presented a graph showing the comparison of existing drainage versus new drainage. He noted that the same amount will go to the rear and front, but there will be two pop up bubblers and a drywell. He stated that there is a slight increase (0.02 cfs) in run-off due to an increase in pavement, but that in the end, no more water will be going to the north or to the street.

Chairman Lichtenfeld noted that the AC units are quite far away.

Mr. Volz indicated that their location is due to the deck. He noted, however, there is a screen.

Ron Reim asked if the neighbor to the west could use this driveway to turn around.

Mr. Scott Mehlman stated that the neighbor is here this evening and that they've shared a lot of correspondence.

Steve Strum, 8177 Stratford, stated that the driveway is not shared and that he will be increasing the size of his driveway.

Ron Reim asked if he can pull out of his garage okay.

Mr. Strum replied "yes".

Being no further questions or comments, Ron Reim made a motion to approve per staff recommendations. The motion was seconded by Pepe Finn and unanimously approved by the members.

The architectural aspects of the project were now up for review.

Susan Istenes explained that the home to the west (8177 Stratford Drive) was constructed in 1952 and is +/- 4.5 feet shorter than the proposed home (as measured from the mid-point of each roof). The home to the east (8169 University Drive) was constructed in 1949 and is +/- 6.8 feet shorter than the proposed home (as measured from the mid-point of each roof). As required by Section 410.385 of the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District, to avoid tall, blocky building forms, new structures shall incorporate a transition in height and scale through one of six possible techniques. According to the applicant, the following permitted technique is used: "Increasing the side yard setback one foot for every five feet the height of the structure exceeds the height of the adjacent structure at the side yard." The required side yard setbacks are 6 feet and the proposed setbacks are 7 feet on the west side and 13 feet on the east side. Clayton Gardens has traditionally been dominated by the use of standard size brick in a variety of red tones, although the original brick has been painted in some instances. The primary building material for the proposed home is brick painted white. The proposed roof is clad in architectural shingles, charcoal blend in color. Black casement windows are proposed. A 9-foot wide exposed aggregate driveway is proposed on the north side of the home that leads to a rear-entry, at-grade attached garage with a black paneled

garage door. A maximum 3.4-foot tall brick retaining wall painted white is proposed along the east side of the driveway. Black aluminum railing will be installed on top of a portion of the retaining wall as required by the Building Code. No permanent fences are proposed. Susan stated that the project as proposed is in conformance with the requirements of the R-2 Single Family Dwelling District, the Clayton Gardens Urban Design District, and the Architectural Review Guidelines. Staff is of the opinion that the design is compatible in terms of mass, height, and design with existing nearby homes and recommends approval as submitted.

Ms. Strutman presented a color rendering of the proposed home to the members. She stated that the 2-story, all brick home, is a traditional style, with French doors, second story dormers and a lot of windows. She presented samples of the brick (white), windows, and roof. She indicated that they have provided greater setbacks to help mitigate height.

Chairman Lichtenfeld commented that the house looks really good.

Note: Craig Owens left the meeting (6 p.m.).

Ron Reim agreed that the house looks great. He added that it will seem very tall to the house behind it due to the grade.

Pepe Finn asked what type of fireplace will be on the deck.

Mr. Mehlman indicated that is yet to be determined.

Being no further questions or comments, Josh Corson made a motion to approve as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ron Reim and unanimously approved by the Board.

\*\*\*\*\*

Pepe Finn commented that the house behind the new house on Stratford is in University City.

Ron Reim asked if property owners in University City receive notice of proposed projects (agendas).

Louis Clayton replied “yes”; adding that the owners of record according to County records are mailed notice to the mailing address on file with the County.

Ron Reim asked about the lack of landscaping on the property on his street.

Louis Clayton stated that he would confer with the inspector and get an update.

Mark Winings informed the members that the Board is considering new fowl regulations and that chicken coops would not require ARB review.

Chairman Lichtenfeld announced that the Mayor's Youth Advisory Council has requested to attend a future Plan Commission/ARB Meeting; possibly the second regular meeting in October (October 19<sup>th</sup>).

Ron Reim stated that he may not be attending the October 19<sup>th</sup> meeting.

Chairman Lichtenfeld asked about the tree ordinance.

Susan Istenes stated that it is stalled for the time being, but that the budget is passed and it is on the list to revamp. She added that staff had met with Laurel (City's landscape architect on contract) earlier this year about the pending legislation.

Being no further question or comments, this meeting adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

---

Recording Secretary